

Hodud in the Light of the Principle of Legality with a Comparative View of Shiite and Sunni Jurisprudence

*Hossein Soleimani**

Received Date: 13/02/2020 - Accepted Date: 21/10/2020

DOI: 10.22096/law.2020.121655.1637

Abstract

In the Islamic Penal Code of 1392, in correct expressions and in accordance with various principles of the Constitution, the principle of legality of crime and punishment, in general, has been accepted and in addition, the full validity of this principle has been emphasized in Taazitat, Qisas and Diyat. Despite this, it seems that the legislator has denied the principle of legality within the Hodud and, according to some principles of the Constitution, has tried to issue a license to refer to jurisprudence regarding the Hodud not mentioned in the penal law.

Despite this, it should be noted that in Islamic jurisprudence, there is a great deal of disagreement about the number of Hodud and their rules and conditions, which in practice both confuses the judge in referring to jurisprudence and causes problems for citizens. In this article, with a brief look at the limitation of behaviors in the words of jurists, we seek to prove that first of all, citing Article 220 of the Islamic Penal Code to Article 167 of the Constitution to justify the permission to refer to jurisprudence in criminalizing illegal behavior is wrong and unprincipled. It is explicit of the constitution, and secondly, if we consider article 220 in the sense of the permission to refer to the applicable jurisprudence, we must suffice with a certain degree of consensus behavior. The author believes that Article 220 is against the principles of the Constitution and should be abrogated.

Keywords: Principle of Legality; non-Mentioned Hodud; Constitution Article 167; Article 220; Sunni Jurisprudence; Shiite Jurisprudence.

* Assistant Professor, Law of Department, Mofid University, Qom, Iran.
Email: soleimani_h@mofidu.ac.ir



Bibliography

A) Book & Articles

- Ahmadzadeh, Rasoul & Gholam Hossein Elham (2016). "A Commentary to the Article (167) of the Constitution (of the Islamic Republic of Iran) from the Perspective of the Islamic Criminal Law", *Quarterly Journal of Majlis & Rahbord*, Vol. 25, No. 95, pp. 247-272. [In Persian]
- Akbari, Mohammad Javad & Seyed Hossein Hashemi (2016). "Analysis of the examples of prescribed Tazirat in Imami jurisprudence: explanation of Note 2 of Article 115 of the Islamic Penal Code of 1392", *Quarterly Journal of Fiqh & Osul*, Vol. 4, No. 4, pp. 33-59. [In Persian]
- Akhoondi, Mahmoud (2015). *Identifying the Criminal Procedure Code, Book One: Generalities and Cases Caused by Crime*, Seventeenth Edition, Tehran: Durandishan. [In Persian]
- Ardabili, Mohammad Ali (2018). *General Criminal Law*, First Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Bashirieh, Tahmoureh (2008). "Protection of Constitutional Rights in the Light of the Interaction of Articles 36 and 167 of the Constitution", *Journal of Justice*, Vol. 72, No. 62 & 63, pp. 145-156. [In Persian]
- Elham, Gholam Hossein & Reza Zahravi (2017). "A Comparative Study of the Challenges Arising from the Silence of the Law in Iranian Criminal Law and Imami Jurisprudence", *Comparative Law Studies*, Vol. 8, No. 2, pp. 443-473. [In Persian]
- Faiz Kashani, Mohammad Mohsen (1981). *Mafatih al-Sharaye*, First edition, Qom: Majma al-Zakhaer al-Islamiyya. [In Arabic]
- Golpayegani, Mohammad Reza (1993). *Al-Dorr Al-Manzoud Fi Ahkam Al-Hudood*, First edition, Qom: Dar Al-Quran Al-Karim. [In Arabic]
- Habibzadeh, Mohammad Jafar & Mohammad Towhidifar (2007). *Rule of law in the Realm of Criminal Law*, First Edition, Tehran: Dadgostar Publishing. [In Persian]
- Habibzadeh, Mohammad Jafar (2004). "Punishment of forbidden action and its conflict with the rule of law in the constitution", *Journal of Constitutional Law*, Vol. 2, No. 3, pp. 8-24. [In Persian]
- Haji Dehabadi, Ahmad (2017). *Crimes against persons: Murder*, First Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Halabi, Taqi al-Din Abu al-Salah (2013). *Al-Kafi Fi al-Fiqh*, research by Reza Ostadi, Second Edition, Qom: Bustan Ketab Institute. [In Arabic]

- Hashemi, Seyed Hossein (2007). *Apostasy and Freedom*, Second Edition, Tehran: Institute of Islamic Culture and Thought. [In Persian]
- Ibn Baraj Trablosi, Abdul Aziz (1986). *Almohazzab*, First Edition, Qom: Islamic Publishing Institute. [In Arabic]
- Ibn fahad Helli, Jamal al-Din Ahmad Ibn Muhammad (1992). *Al-Madhhab al-Bar'i fi Sharh al-Mukhtasar al-Naf*, First Edition, Qom: Islamic Publishing Institute. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Hazm Zaheri, Ali Ibn Ahmad Ibn Sa'id (1933). *Almohalla*, First Edition, Cairo: Al-Muniriyya Printing Office. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Humam al-Hanafi, Muhammad Ibn Abd al-Wahed (2003). *Sharh Fath al-Qadir ala al-Hidayah*, First Edition, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-Elmiyyah. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Najim al-Mesri al-Hanafi, Zayn al-Din Ibn Ibrahim (1997). *al-Bahr al-Raeigh Sharh Kanz al-Daghaigh (fi foroee Al-Hanafiyya)*, First Edition, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-Elmiyyah. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Qudamah al-Maqdisi Hanbali (2000). Abdullah ibn Muhammad, *Al-Muqna fi Fiqh al-Imam Ahmad Ibn Hanbal al-Shaybani*, First Edition, Jaddah: Maktaba al-savadi. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Sa'id Helli, Yahya (1985). *Aljame al-sharaye*, First Edition, Qom: Maktaba al-elmiyyah. [In Arabic]
- Ibn Uthaymeen, Muhammad Ibn Saleh (2004). *al-Sharh al-Mumatta ala Zad al-Mustaqnaa*, First Edition, Riyadh: Dar Ibn Al-Jawzi. [In Arabic]
- Imam Khomeini Publishing House (2000). *Sahifeye Imam*, Third Edition, Tehran: Imam Khomeini Publishing House. [In Persian]
- Jaziri, Abdul Rahman (2003). *al-Fiqh ala Mazaheb al-arbaa*, Second Edition, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-Elmiyyah. [In Arabic]
- *Journal of the Islamic Republic (Rooznameye Jomhooriye Eslami)*, 7 Azar 1385, No. 7927.
- Karimi, Hossein (1996). *Judicial Standards from Imam Khomeini's Perspective*, First Edition, Qom: Shakoori Publications. [In Persian]
- Katouzian, Amir Nasser (1997). "The position of Islamic law in the legal order", *Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Science*, Vol. 36, No. 0, pp. 41-72. [In Persian]
- Khoei, Seyyed Abolghasem (2014). *Mabani Takmila al-Minhaj*, Fourth Edition, Tehran: Khorsandi Publications. [In Arabic]
- Mahameli al-Shafi'i, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad (1995). *Al-Lobab fi Fiqh al-Shafi'i*, First Edition, Medina: Dar al-Bukhari. [In Arabic]
- Majlisi, Mohammad Baqir (?). *Hudud, Qisas and Diyat*, First Edition, Tehran: Islamic Works Publishing Institute. [In Persian]

- Mansourabadi, Abbas (2018). *Generalities of Criminal Law*, Fourth Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Mazhar Gharamaleki Ali & Ali Dadkhah (2018). "Criminalization of heresy; A Comparative Study in Islamic Religions ", *Quarterly Journal of Jurisprudence and Fundamentals of Islamic Law*, Vol. 51, No. 1, pp. 221-243. [In Persian]
- Mohaghegh Damad, Seyed Mostafa (2015). *Rules of Jurisprudence*, Vol. 4, Penal Section, 31th Edition, Tehran: Islamic Sciences Publishing Center. [In Persian]
- Mohaqeq Ardabili, Ahmad Ibn Muhammad (1996). *Majma 'al-Fa'ida wa al-Burhan fi Sharh Irshad al-Azhan*, Second Edition, Qom: Islamic Publishing Institute. [In Arabic]
- Mohaqeq Helli, Ja'far Ibn al-Hassan (2004). *Sharaye al-Islam fi al-Halal wa al-Haram*, with commentaries by Seyeed Sadegh Hosseini Shirazi, 11th Edition, Beirut: Dar al-Qari. [In Arabic]
- Mohaqeq Helli, Ja'far Ibn Hassan (1992). *Al-Mukhtasar al-Nafi '*, First Edition, Qom: Maktab al-Be'atha. [In Arabic]
- Mohaqeq Karaki (1988). *Rasa'il al-Muhaqiq al-Karaki*, First Edition, Qom: Maktab Ayatollah Al-Uzmi Al-Marashi Al-Najafi. [In Arabic]
- Montazer, Hossein Ali (1988). *Kitab al-Hodud*, Qom: Dar al-Fekr Publishing. [In Arabic]
- Mousavi Ardebili, Seyyed Abdulkarim (2006). *Fiqh al-Hodud wa al-Taazirat*, Second Edition, Qom: Mofid University Press. [In Arabic]
- Mousavi Ardebili, Seyyed Abdulkarim (2013). *Law and Criminal Justice in the Mirror of Jurisprudence*, First Edition, Qom: Radnegar Publishing. [In Persian]
- Mousavi Khomeini, Sayyid Ruhollah (1997). *Tahrir al-Wasila*, First Edition, Damascus: Embassy of the Islamic Republic of Iran. [In Arabic]
- Mousaviyan, Seyed Abolfazl (2010). *Religion and Freedom: A Discussion on Freedom of Belief, Elementary Jihad and Apostasy*, First Edition, Qom: Sahifa Kherad. [In Persian]
- Nasafi, Abdullah Ibn Ahmad (2011). *Kanz al-Daqa'iq fi Fiqh al-Hanafi*, First Edition, Medina: Dar al-Siraj. [In Arabic]
- Nowbahar, Rahim (2010). *Aims of Punishments in Sexual Crimes: Islamic Perspective*, First Edition, Qom: Institute of Islamic Sciences and Culture. [In Persian]
- Nowbahar, Rahim (2017). *The Judicial Principle of Punishments: A Jurisprudential Analysis of the Right to a Fair Trial*, Second Edition, Tehran: Shahr-e Danesh. [In Persian]

- Omid, Jalil (2018). "Islamic Theory of Interpretation of Criminal Texts", in: Ali Hossein Najafi Abrandabadi (under review), *Encyclopedia of Criminal Sciences*, Book 3, First Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Omid, Jalil (2019). *Interpretation of the law in criminal law*, First Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Qarnati, Muhammad Ibn Ahmad (2013). *al-Ghavanin al-Fiqhiyya fi Talkhish Mazhab al-Malikiyya wa al-Tanbih ala Mazhab al-Shafi'iyya wa al-Hanafiyya wa al-Hanbaliyya*, First Edition, Beirut: Dar Ibn Hazm. [In Arabic]
- Sayyid Morteza (1994). Ali Ibn Hussein, *Al-Entesar*, First Edition, Qom: Islamic Publishing Institute. [In Arabic]
- Shahid Thani, Sheikh Zayn al-Din Ameli (2016). *Al-Rawdha al-Bahiyya fi Sharh al-Loma al-Dameshqiyyah*, Twelfth Edition, Qom: Islamic Thought Association. [In Arabic]
- Shahid Thani, Zayn al-Din bin Ali al-Ameli (2008). *Masalek al-Afham ela Tanqih Sharaye al-Islam*, Fourth Edition, Qom: Moassesa al-Maarif al-Islamiyyah. [In Arabic]
- Sheikh Baha'i, Mohammad Ibn Hussein (1901). *Jame Abbasi*, Tehran: Farahani Publications. [In Arabic]
- Sheikh Saduq, Muhammad Ibn Ali Ibn Babawiyh (1964). *Al-Muqna*, second Edition, Qom: Imam Al-Hadi Institute. [In Arabic]
- Sheikh Tusi, Muhammad Ibn Hassan (1980). *al-Nahaya fi Mojarrad al-Fiqh wa al-Fatawi*, Second Edition, Beirut: Dar al-Kitab al-Arabi. [In Arabic]
- Shovraye Negahban Research Center (2012). *Jurisprudential Foundations of the Guardian Council Jurists' Opinions on the Hudud and Qisas Bill and Its Regulations*, First Edition, Tehran: Deputy for Codification, Revision and Publication of Laws and Regulations. [In Persian]
- Soleimani, Hossein (2019). "Designated and Textual Tazirat in Islamic Penal Code in the Light of the principle of legality", *Criminal Law Research*, Vol. 19, No. 1, pp. 105-133. [In Persian]
- Soleimani, Hossein (2020). "The position and scope of Article 220 of the Islamic Penal Code in the light of the principle of Legality (with emphasis on apostasy)", in: Mahmoudi Janaki, Firooz and Gholamlou, Jamshid (by effort), *Proceedings of the conference International Developments in Criminal Law of Islamic Countries in the Light of the Interaction of Sharia and Law*, First Edition, Tehran: Mizan Publishing. [In Persian]
- Tabatabai Hakim, Sayyid Muhammad Sa'id (2006). *Masail-on Muasera fi Fiqh al-Qaza*, Second Edition, Najaf Ashraf: Dar al-Hilal. [In Arabic]

- Tabatabai Yazdi, Seyyed Mohammad Kazem (2014). *Al-Urwa Al-Wathqa wa al-Taaliqat alayha* (2014), First Edition, Qom: Al-Sabtain Al-Alamiya Institute. [In Arabic]
- Tabrizi, Javad (2007). *Tanghih Mabani al-Urvah: Ketab al-Sawm*, First Edition, Qom: Dar al-Sadiqah al-Shahidah. [In Arabic]
- Valaei, Issa (2010). "Hadd and Ta'zir and cases of replacing each other with an approach to the view of Imam Khomeini", *Matin Research Journal*, Vol. 13, No. 53, pp. 141-160. [In Persian]