

Compensation for Innocent Accused and Wrongfully Convicted the in the Legal System of Iran and Canada

*Ali Reza Bariklou**

*Hasan Badini ***

*Mohammad Kazem Khanjani****

Received Date: 23/10/2018 - Accepted Date: 26/05/2019

DOI:10.22096/law.2019.95144.1338

Abstract

Compensation for the Accused and convicted whose innocence is proven by obvious consequent factors is one of the challenging issues in private and criminal law. In the past few years, Iranian legal system has experienced positive changes in the compensation of acquitted accused but until now, no coherent mechanism is foreseen to those who have endured part or all of the sentence and their innocence has been proven. This is contrariwise in the Canadian legal system and only innocent convicts who have served part of the wrongful sentence are deserving to compensation. Rational logic and justice along by the general rules of civil liability and the text of the United Nations International Convention of Civil and Political Rights demonstrate that compensation of two above mentioned damages in all legal systems are necessary. In this research, while investigating the international binding rules governing the subject, we try to provide an integrative theory included of eliminating deficiencies, changing extant rules, and legislation by a comparative study on legal systems of Iran and Canada to more realize the fairness and justice.

Keywords: Wrongful Conviction; Judicial Mistake; Compensation; Innocent Accused and Convicted.

* Professor, Department of Private Law, University of Tehran, Farabi Branch, Qom, Iran.

Email: bariklou@ut.ac.ir

** Associate Professor, Faculty of Law and Political Science, University of Tehran, Tehran, Iran.

Email: hbadini@ut.ac.ir

*** PhD Student in Private Law, University of Tehran, Kish International Branch, Tehran, Iran.

Email: mk.khanjani@ut.ac.ir



Bibliography

A) Book & Articles

- Ahmadi, Seyed Mohsen (2016). *Execution of Criminal Sentences*, Tehran: Mizan Legal Foundation. [In Persian]
- Anderson, Andrea (2015). "Wrongful Convictions and the Avenues of Redress: The Post-Conviction Review Process in Canada, Appeal", *Review of Current Law and Law Reform*, Vol. 61, No. 114. pp. 135-181.
- Asghari Aqamshahdi, Fakhreddin & Javad Ghorbani Disfani (2008). "The Tortuous Liability of Judges in Iranian Law", *Quarterly Journal of the Faculty of Law and Political Sciences*, Vol. 2, No. 7, pp. 35-48. [In Persian]
- Ashoori, Mohammad (2007). *Criminal Procedure*, Tehran: SAMT Publication. [In Persian]
- Ashoori, Mohammad (2016). *Criminal justice (Collection of Articles)*, Tehran: Ganjedanesh Publication. [In Persian]
- Badini, Hassan & Reza Khodkar (2016). "Analysis of Negligence Rule Efficiency in Iranian Law", *Private Law Studies Quarterly*, Vol. 46, No. 1, p. 34. [In Persian]
- Badini, Hassan (2012). "Absolute Liability, Principles and Examples", *Comparative Law Review*, Vol. 3, No. 1, pp. 19-36. [In Persian]
- Bariklou, AliReza (2007). *Civil Liability*, Tehran: Mizan Publication. [In Persian]
- Eid, Elisabeth (2001). "Interaction between International and Domestic Human Rights Law: A Canadian Perspective", Elisabeth Eid, *International Conference on the Ratification and Implementation of Human Rights Covenants*, Senior Counsel, Human Rights Law Section, Department of Justice Canada.
- Elham, Gholam Hossei & Mostafa Nasiri (2016). "Judicial Discretion on Issuance of Criminal Warrants", *Majlis & Rahbord*, Vol. 23, No. 87, p. 165. [In Persian]
- Elham, Gholam Hossein & Hossein Golduzian (2013). "Analysis of the Concept of Entrapment; A Comparative Approach to American and Iranian Criminal Law", *Quarterly Journal of Criminal Law Research*, Vol. 2, No. 4, p. 108. [In Persian]
- Farajiha, Mohammad (2009). "Challenge of Community-Based Punishment Assesmet", *Legal Journal of Justice*, Vol. 72, No. 64, pp. 13-32. [In Persian]
- Finley, Lora L (2016). "Crime and Punishment in America, Santa Barbabara", *Pennsylvania Evening Post*, Vol. 18, No. 88, pp. 145-188.

- Forst, Brian (2004). *Errors of justice: Nature, sources and remedies*, London: Cambridge University Press.
- Ghaffari, Mohammad Reza (2010). "The Logic of Comparative Research", *Iranian Social Study*, Vol. 3, No. 4, pp. 76-90. [In Persian]
- Habibzadeh, Mohammad Jafar & Fereshte Asadi (2008). "Judicial Immunity of Judges and Advocates in the Iranian Legal System", *Law Quarterly of Faculty of Law and Political Science*, Vol. 38, No. 4, p. 69. [In Persian]
- Helena, Katz (2011). *Justice Miscarried inside Wrongful conviction in Canada*, Toronto: Dundurn.
- Hosseini, Seyed Mohammad & Masoud Mostafapour (2018). "Dark Figure: A Challenge for Official Criminal Statistics (with a Comparative Approach to America and Iran)", *Comparative Law Review*, Vol. 8, No. 1, pp. 103-129. [In Persian]
- Javid, Mohammad Javad & Esmat Shah Moradi (2018). "A Comparative Study on Developments of Human Rights in Criminal Procedure law and International Documents", *Legal Research Quarterly*, Vol. 19, No. 78, pp. 83-106. [In Persian]
- Karaffa, Kerry M. & Julie M. Koch (2017). "Compensating the Innocent: Perceptions of Exonerees Deservingness to Receive Financial Compensation for Wrongful Convictions", *Criminal Justice Policy Review*, Vol. 5, No. 125, pp. 7-28.
- Khaleghi, Ali (2018). *Criminal Procedure law*, Vol. 1, Tehran: Shahr-e-Danesh Publications. [In Persian]
- Khani, Mohammad (2009). "Civil Liability of State", *Advocacy Magazine*, Vol. 1, No. 35, pp. 36-40. [In Persian]
- Khazani, Manouchehr (2000). *Criminal Process (Collection of Articles)*, Tehran: Ganjedanesh Publication. [In Persian]
- Maqrebi, Ghazi Naman (1963). *Principles of Islam and Expression of Halal and Haram and Theorems and Provisions from the Ahl al-Beit of Prophet Mohammad (God bless him and his family and grant them peace)*, Qom: Daaralmaaref Publication. [In Arabic]
- Mehrabadi, Mitra (2006). "Legislation in the Ideas of the Proponents and opponents of the conditional", *Scientific Journal of History Research*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 77-90. [In Persian]
- Mohaghegh Damad, Seyed Mostafa (2002). *Rules of Jurisprudence (Criminal Section)*, Tehran: Humanities Publishing Center. [In Persian]
- Mohseni, Ali Reza (2009). "Pathology of Prison Sentences", *Procedure Monthly Magazin*, Vol. 12, No. 6, pp. 3-9. [In Persian]

- Mohseni, Farid (2012). "Corporate Crimes: A Criminological Viewpoint", *Judicial Law Views*, Vol. 17, No. 57, p. 16. [In Persian]
- Moosavi Bojnordi, Seyed Mohammad (2007). "Rule of Action", *Judicial Law Views Quarterly (Law Views)*, Vol. 16, No. 2, p. 84. [In Persian]
- Moradi, Majid (2012). "Publication of Convictions of Defendants and Innocent Convicts in the Press", *Culmination of Law*, Vol. 3, No. 11, p. 87. [In Persian]
- Mosadegh, Mohammad (2018). *Criminal Procedure*, Vol. 7, Tehran: Jangal Publication. [In Persian]
- Nowak, Manfred (2005). *The International Covenants on Civil and Political Rights and on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights*, in: *The Essentials of Human Rights*, London: Edward Arnold Publication.
- Osborne, Philip H. (2007). *The Law of Torts*, Toronto: Irwin Law Publication.
- Patricia Mijares, Laura (2012). *Compensation for Wrongful Convictions: A study toward an effective regime of tort liability*, Toronto: Graduate Department of Faculty of Law, University of Toronto.
- Rahami, Mohsen (2007). "Restorative Justice in Iranian Postrevolutionary Criminal Law", *Law and Political Science*, Vol. 74, No. 74, p. 156. [In Persian]
- Robin, L. Sydney (2008). *In The Matter of Steven Truscott: Advisory Opinion on the Issue of Compensation*, Ottawa: Ministry of the Attorney General.
- Sefani, Gereg; Gorge Levasseur & Bab Bouloc (2004). *Procedure Penale*, Paris: Dollaz.
- Shamloo, Bagher & Majid Moradi (2015). "Compensation for Innocent Accused and Convicted; Legal Position and Practical Process", *Legal Journal of Justice*, Vol. 78, No. 88, pp. 213-248. [In Persian]
- Stunz, William J (2011). *The Collapse of America Criminal Justice*, London: the Belknap Press of Harvard University Press.
- Tabari, Mohammad Bin Jarir (1997). *Tarikh al-Rusul wa al-Muluk*, Tehran: Bina Publication. [In Persian]
- Tibergh, Hugo (2010). *Compensation for Wrongful Imprisonment*, London: Criminal law review.
- Vahdati Shobeiri, Seyed Hasan & Ehsan Samani (2018). "A Research about Type of State Responsibility for Its Staff Actions", *Quarterly Journal of Religion and Law*, Vol. 4, No. 14, pp. 125-138. [In Persian]
- Walsh, Kelly & Jeanette Hussemann (2017). *Estimating the Prevalence of Wrong Convictions*, London: Criminal law review.
- Yazdani, Mohmmad Reza (2003). "Special rules and regulations governing temporary detention", *Legal Journal of Justice*, No. 38, pp. 238-243. [In Persian]

B) Document

- United Nations (1966). "International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights", Vol. 999, No. 14668.

C) Website

- "Canada's prison system doesn't support life after exoneration Stern", (Accessed: 1th September 2018), Available at: <https://tvo.org/article/current-affairs/canadas-prison-system-doesnt-support-life-after-exoneration>.
- "Canada's prison system doesn't support life after exoneration", (Accessed: 1th September 2018), Stern, Cara (2015). Available at: <https://tvo.org/article/current-affairs/canadas-prison-system-doesnt-support-life-after-exoneration>.
- "Compensation for Wrongfully Convicted and Imprisoned Persons", AIDWYC (the Association in Defence of the Wrongly Convicted or Innocence Canada) (2018). Available at: <http://www.innocencecanada.com/the-legal-path-to-exoneration/> (Accessed: 5th September 2018).
- "Upper limit non-pecuniary damages in Canada: cap imposed in *Andrews v. Grand & Toy*", (Accessed: 1th September 2018), *Boyd v. Harris* (2004). Available at: <https://tvo.org/article/current-affairs/canadas-prison-system-doesnt-support-life-after-exoneration>.
- "Why Compensation for Family Members Should be at Market Value", D'Avella, (Accessed: 5th September 2018), Bernard J. (2018). Available at: <https://view2.fdu.edu/academics/silberman-college/centers-and-institutes/rothman-institute-of-entrepreneurship/outreach-programs/family-business-forum/family-ink-articles/17-compensation-at-market-value/>.
- "Wrongful Convictions in Canada", (Forthcoming in 2011), Roach, Kent (2012). Available at: <http://ssrn.com/abstract=1887889>.